

Charge to the Delta Science Program Independent Review Panel for the BDCP Effects Analysis Review, Phase 2

The Panel will be charged with assessing the scientific soundness of Chapter 5: Effects Analysis and many of the associated technical appendices. Appendices 5.E: Habitat Restoration and 5.G: Fish Life Cycle Models will not be reviewed at this time. The Panel will make recommendations for how these might be improved with respect to achieving their stated goals. Specific attention will be given to the following questions:

Chapter 5: Effects Analysis

Goals, Purpose, Objectives and Scope

1. How well does the Effects Analysis meet its expected goals?

Completeness, Structure and Effectiveness of Description

2. How complete is the Effects Analysis; how clearly are the methods described?
3. Is the analysis in the Effects Analysis reasonable and scientifically defensible? How clearly are the roll-up results conveyed in the text, figures and tables?

Approach and Analysis

4. Does the Effects Analysis integrate an appropriate suite of analyses? Were appropriate analyses used?
5. How well is uncertainty addressed? How could communication of uncertainty be improved?
6. How well does the Effects Analysis describe how conflicting model results and analyses in the technical appendices are interpreted?
7. How well does the Effects Analysis link to adaptive management and associated monitoring programs?

Technical Appendices

For each technical appendix:

Approach and Analysis

1. How well are the proposed analytical tools defined, discussed and integrated?
2. How clear and reasonable is the scale of analysis?
3. How were the methods and vision of the Foundation and Framework modified based on the panels comments and how well are they applied in the technical appendices/analyses? How consistently are they applied?
4. How well did the technical appendix evaluate the effects of potential BDCP conservation measures on the specified variable(s)?
5. Were the conclusions drawn from the results accurate and did these conclusions appropriately consider scientific uncertainty?

Models

6. Were appropriate models used in the technical appendices? If model results conflicted, was this clearly stated and were appropriate interpretations made?
7. How well are the models and analyses described, interpreted and summarized?

REVIEW MATERIALS

- Draft Chapter 5: Effects Analysis
- Appendix 5.B: Entrainment
- Appendix 5.C: Flow, Passage, Salinity, and Turbidity
- Appendix 5.D: Contaminants
- Appendix 5.F: Biological Stressors on Covered Fish
- Appendix 5.H: Aquatic Construction Effects
- Appendix 5.J: Scenario 6 Comparison
- Appendix 5.K: Effects on Natural Communities, Wildlife, and Plants

SUPPORTING INFORMATION

- Draft Responses to Delta Science Program Review Panel Report on BDCP Effects Analysis - November 2011
- Highlights of the BDCP (December 2010)
(http://resources.ca.gov/docs/Highlights_of_the_BDCP_FINAL_12-14-10_2361.pdf)
- BDCP Working Draft (2010)
(http://baydeltaconservationplan.com/BDCPPlanningProcess/ReadDraftPlan/ReadDraftPlan_copy1.aspx)
- NRC 2011 Panel Report - A Review of the Use of Science and Adaptive Management In California's Draft Bay Delta Conservation Plan
(http://www.nap.edu/openbook.php?record_id=13148&page=33)
- Science Advisors Draft Report on BDCP Goals and Objectives for Covered Fish Species (http://baydeltaconservationplan.com/Libraries/2011_Working_Groups/6-16-11_Draft_Final_BDCP_G_O_Science_Advisors_Report.sflb.ashx)
- Regulatory Framework for the BDCP Effects Analysis Relating to Species and Habitat Covered by the Plan and Incidental Take Permits
- Rationale for Five Agency Proposed Alternative BDCP Initial Project Operations Criteria
- Draft BDCP Chapter 1: Introduction
 - Appendix 1.A: Evaluation of Species Considered for Coverage
- Draft BDCP Chapter 3: Conservation Strategy (and relevant appendices)
 - Section 3.1 and 3.2 – Introduction and Methods
 - Section 3.3 – Biological Goals and Objectives
 - Sections 3.4 and 3.5 – Conservation Measures and Important Regional Actions
 - Section 3.6 - Adaptive Management and Monitoring Program
 - Appendix 3.A: Background on the Process of Developing the BDCP Conservation Measures
 - Appendix 3.C: Avoidance and Minimization Measures

- Appendix 3.D: Natural Community And Covered Species Habitat Existing Condition—Acreages by Conservation Zone
- Draft BDCP Chapter 4: Covered Activities and Associated Federal Actions
- Draft BDCP Chapter 6: Plan Implementation